

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,  
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEMS  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL NO. 2327

---

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO THE CASE(S)  
ON THE ATTACHED EXHIBIT(S)

**ORDER**  
(Dismissing Ethicon Defendants without Prejudice)

Pending in MDL 2327, 2:12-md-2327 [ECF No. 7917] is a Joint Motion to Dismiss without Prejudice filed by plaintiff(s), identified in Exhibit(s) A, and Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and/or Ethicon, LLC (collectively referred to as “Ethicon”). The Motion seeks an order granting dismissal of the Ethicon defendants without prejudice.

The court **ORDERS** that:

- (1) the Joint Motion to Dismiss without Prejudice is **GRANTED**; and
- (2) the Ethicon defendants are **DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE** from the action(s) listed on the attached Exhibit(s) A;
- (3) if there are no remaining defendants in a civil action, then (a) that civil action is dismissed and stricken from the docket and (b) any pending motions are **DENIED** as moot.

The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to:

- (1) dismiss the Ethicon defendants from the individual civil action(s) without prejudice;
- (2) if no other defendants remain in an individual action, then (a) strike the action from the docket, and (b) close the case;

(3) file a copy of this Order in MDL 2327 and in each individual case on the attached

Exhibit(s); and,

(4) send a copy of this Order to counsel of record and any unrepresented party.

ENTER: May 9, 2019



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Joseph R. Goodwin". Below the signature, there is a horizontal line. Underneath the line, the name "JOSEPH R. GOODWIN" is printed in capital letters, followed by "UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE" in a slightly smaller font.

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

**EXHIBIT A**

| <b>Civil Action No.</b> | <b>Case Style</b>  |
|-------------------------|--|
| 2:15-cv-05063           | Diane Mace and Thomas Betenson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:15-cv-00807           | Dinah Shuman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:15-cv-01880           | Mary Straight and Richard Straight v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:15-cv-05139           | Karen Gossett v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:14-cv-28873           | Dorothy Abruzzese and Vince Abruzzese v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:14-cv-29056           | Yvonne Adams and Chris Adams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:14-cv-28886           | Ana Alea-Schilichting v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:14-cv-28760           | Cynthia Anderson and Joseph Anderson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-29038           | Kristin Armour and Jeffrey Armour, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson     |
| 2:16-cv-01706           | Patricia Auten and Dwight Auten v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-28029           | Sherry Beckworth v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:14-cv-29320           | Jenny Bird and Robert Bird v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:14-cv-27900           | Franchesca Bittaye and Modou Bittaye v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-28575           | Doneisha Blake-Rogers and J.D. Rogers, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:16-cv-01487           | Patricia Blasi v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:15-cv-03729           | Carol Duffy Block v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:14-cv-29338           | Angie Bolden v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:14-cv-18529           | Helen Boothe and Zimmie Boothe v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-28925           | Margarita Briggs and Michael J. Briggs v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson     |
| 2:14-cv-28756           | Aleatha Bright v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-28777           | Suzette Brodie v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-30595           | Annette Brooks v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-28133           | Jamie Karen Brown v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:14-cv-30366           | Priscilla Burgess v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:14-cv-29339           | Sherry Canterbury and William Canterbury v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-05115           | Deborah Castillo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:15-cv-00366           | Alisa Cawood v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:14-cv-29712           | Becky Chapman and Leslie Dean Chapman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:14-cv-28682           | Patricia Coby v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-03227           | Gladys Collado and Robinson Collado v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-28684           | Rebecca Collamore and Donald Collamore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson     |
| 2:15-cv-03674           | Nancy Collins v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-00024           | Flossie Combs and Herbert Combs v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:16-cv-01488           | Hazel Conley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:16-cv-01707           | Carmen Correa Filomeno v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:14-cv-31258           | Cindy Cox v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-29061 | Carol Coy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-29057 | Shameeka Crocker and Demetrius Knox v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:16-cv-01700 | Monica Curry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:15-cv-03231 | Joan Davis and George Wayne Davis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:15-cv-03728 | Susan DeFoy and Robert DeFOy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:16-cv-04472 | Juanita Dillman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-30784 | Joan Dingman and Lyle Dingman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:15-cv-03671 | Imelda Dorsey and Derek Dorsey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:14-cv-29062 | Jamie Douglas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:15-cv-00816 | Itsia Ducharme and Frank Ducharme v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:14-cv-01454 | Bobbette Enrietta and Evan Enrietta v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:15-cv-05134 | Rebecca Escobedo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:15-cv-03240 | Virginia Fierro v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:16-cv-01730 | Leslie Fitzgerald and Bryan Fitzgerald v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:16-cv-10218 | Kathie Fleming and Bill Fleming v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:14-cv-28765 | Melissa Flowers Waters and Gary James Waters v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:14-cv-28763 | Rhonda Foltz and Charles Foltz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:16-cv-01672 | Evelyn Font-Galarza and Salvador Font v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:16-cv-01489 | Teresa Ford v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                       |
| 2:14-cv-28926 | Susan Franklin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:15-cv-04853 | Debra Franks and Altus Franks, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-28784 | Lydia Frazier and Billy Frazier v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:14-cv-28787 | Evelyn Freeman and Gary Freeman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:14-cv-28916 | Martha Garcia and Alejandro Garcia v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-29222 | Sharon Gatto and Mario Gatto v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:14-cv-27787 | Evelyn Gentry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:15-cv-03730 | Karen Getchell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:16-cv-01673 | Evelyn Gibson and Tony Gibson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:14-cv-30794 | Deneen Glass and Brian Glass v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:14-cv-28150 | Mercedes Guerrero and Milton Mero v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:16-cv-01674 | Carol Guillory and Cary Guillory v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:14-cv-28754 | Karen Haney and Avery Haney v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                       |
| 2:14-cv-18528 | Charlotte Harrell and Marvin Harrell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:16-cv-01708 | Robin Harty and Todd Harty v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:14-cv-28768 | Emily Hawk v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-01731 | Eliza Jane Heath v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:16-cv-01675 | Belinda Hegarty v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:16-cv-01676 | Kathie Herdman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:14-cv-29060 | Lisa Herrera and Bernard Castilleja v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:15-cv-03731 | Zina Hicks v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:14-cv-30778 | Audrey Hines v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:16-cv-01494 | Tina Holbert v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:14-cv-28668 | Diana Hudson and Jimmy Hudson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-28177 | Karen Hughes and Donald Hughes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:14-cv-28677 | Jeannette Humphrey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-04859 | Bonnie Lee Jackson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-00005 | DeLena Jacquez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:16-cv-06478 | Valsa Joseph and Thomas Joseph v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:14-cv-28178 | Sherry Kannegieter and Trill Kannegieter v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-28578 | Cornelia Key and Ronnie Key v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:16-cv-01724 | Samantha Kilker v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:16-cv-01679 | Amy Kizzire and Billy Kizzire v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:16-cv-02480 | Gail Kochis and Thomas Kochis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:15-cv-03678 | Loretta Koochagian v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:16-cv-02010 | Rosie Koverman and Daniel Koverman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:14-cv-27850 | Denise Lagou v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:16-cv-01680 | Julia Lane v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:16-cv-01739 | Laurie Large and John Large v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:15-cv-03765 | Lacey Murphy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:16-cv-01734 | Coleen Leavy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:15-cv-12896 | Maxine Legore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-28783 | Liliana Lipkowicz and Louis Lipkowicz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson           |
| 2:13-cv-32999 | Vera Lockwood and Donnie Lockwood v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:16-cv-02009 | Kellie Marshall v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:15-cv-01557 | Estela Mata and Moises Mata v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:16-cv-01682 | Judy Melanson and Kenneth Melanson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:14-cv-28891 | Valerie Middlebrooks-Pierce v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:16-cv-01686 | Gwendalynn Miller and James Miller, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:15-cv-03241 | Theresa Miller v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:15-cv-03247 | Louise Mistretta v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:15-cv-03762 | Deborah Morrison and Samuel Morrison v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-30798 | Christine Moyer and Jonathan Moyer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:14-cv-29479 | Anita Mundy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:16-cv-03720 | Loretta Nelson and James Nelson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:14-cv-28021 | Rosalva Olivarez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:16-cv-01710 | Helen Painter and Jerry Painter v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:15-cv-05565 | Theresa Palmer and Ken Palmer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:15-cv-00369 | Tammy Parah v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:15-cv-00547 | Deborah Patterson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:15-cv-03766 | Deborah Phillips and Dewey Phillips v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-29716 | Roxann Phillips and Glen Phillips v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:16-cv-01687 | Tonya Pickett v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:15-cv-03680 | Darlene Price v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:15-cv-00007 | Betty Procell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:16-cv-02034 | Barbara Rajcevich and Gene Michael v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:16-cv-02033 | Shirley Rawlings v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-31262 | Debra Rebman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-29714 | Launi Renshaw v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:15-cv-03248 | Charlene Richards v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:15-cv-00820 | Bonnie Berry and Randal Berry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:15-cv-01493 | Mariangelly Rivera v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:16-cv-01690 | Lourdes Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:14-cv-29116 | Maria Denise Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:16-cv-01688 | Ramonita Rodriguez and Jose Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-29223 | Sheryl Rodriguez and Kim Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson          |
| 2:15-cv-03249 | Mary Rosado and Jose Rosado v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:16-cv-01691 | Ivette Rosario v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:14-cv-28788 | Lisa Russell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:16-cv-01693 | Margaret Sherman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:16-cv-01694 | Alicia Shorten v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:14-cv-28579 | Heather Simmons and Mark Wiseman v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:16-cv-01733 | Rajmatti Singh v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-04869 | Carol Smith and Nathan Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:16-cv-04505 | Marlene Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:16-cv-06496 | Nancy Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:16-cv-04463 | Paula Smrek v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:14-cv-29039 | Shannon Speights v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:15-cv-04982 | April Stalsberg v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-28125 | Dorothy Starner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-30780 | Carol Stephens v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:16-cv-10215 | Jennie Sturtevant v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:16-cv-01695 | Michelle Sweet v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:14-cv-28781 | Jennifer Terryberry and Mark Terryberry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson     |
| 2:14-cv-29484 | Patricia Thompson Meren Thompson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-28914 | Jo Tinnemeyer and Brad Tinnemeyer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson           |
| 2:14-cv-28577 | Charlene Toaster v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:15-cv-03768 | Cynthia Toole v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:16-cv-02032 | Agnes Tornblom v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-05152 | Brigette Travasos and Todd Travasos v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:14-cv-28039 | Sandra Turner and Lovell Turner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-22286 | Angela Vandervort and Richard Vandervort v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson    |
| 2:14-cv-28192 | Michelle Vanpijkeren and Henrik Vanpijkeren v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:16-cv-04504 | Tammy Varona v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-28662 | Karen Villanueva and Guadalupe Villanueva v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-28666 | Evelyn Williams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:15-cv-05301 | Ginger Williams and Howard Williams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:14-cv-28670 | Tracey Williams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:16-cv-01740 | Gwenn Wilson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 2:14-cv-29642 | Sarah Wilson and Gary D. Wilson, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-11844 | Terri Wintermote and Tommie Wintermote v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:15-cv-03769 | Catherine Wolf and Fred K. Wolf v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:16-cv-10213 | Maurcia Woods and Shang Woods v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson          |
| 2:16-cv-01697 | Susan Worcester and David Worcester v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson    |
| 2:15-cv-03770 | Joyce Young and David Young v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:15-cv-00806 | Wanda Young v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:16-cv-01702 | Nelly Lorenzana and Alfredo Lorenzana v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-01696 | Wanda Watters v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |